

Rob Hillis, Engineering Manager
City of West Kelowna
204-879 Anders Road
West Kelowna, BC V1Z 1K2

February 24, 2021

Contract #: 2020-11-T800

Project #: 60557308

Dear Mr. Hillis:

Subject: **Rose Valley WTP Main Works Tender Evaluation**

The City received four (4) tenders by 2:00pm on the tender closing date of February 18, 2021 for the Rose Valley WTP Main Works Contract. A summary of the tender results is provided in Table 1. A detailed summary of tender results can be found in Attachment A. Note there is an arithmetic error in the tender price breakdown provided by Aecon. The difference between the tender price breakdown is \$58,000. (Total Tender Price is \$ 55,837,300 versus a calculated value of \$ 55,895,300 from the tender price breakdown). As per the tender documents the total tender amount governs.

Table 1 - Summary of Tender Results

Item	Tenderer	Tender Price (excl. GST)
1	Aecon Water Infrastructure Inc.	\$ 55,837,300.00
2	Graham Infrastructure LP	\$ 55,633,230.00
3	Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd.	\$ 45,151,535.00
4	PCL Constructors Westcoast Inc.	\$ 52,631.535.00

There were numerous submissions required by each contractor to make a complete Tender submission. During the tender evaluation the required submissions were reviewed for completeness and compliance. Based on this review Table 2 was produced. As note in Table 2 below, all the submittals required to make a complete tender were provided except for the Tender Breakdown from Graham Infrastructure LP. This submittal was incomplete so the Graham Infrastructure LP tender was deemed incomplete.

Table 2 – Tender Submission Checklist

Tender Document	Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd.	PCL Constructors Westcoast Inc.	Aecon Water Infrastructure Inc.	Graham Infrastructure LP
ITT Initialed	YES	YES	YES	YES
Tender Checklist	YES	YES	YES	YES
Tender Form	YES	YES	YES	YES
Tender Price Breakdown	YES	YES	YES*	NO

Preliminary Construction Schedule	YES	YES	YES	YES
Subcontractors and Suppliers	YES	YES	YES	YES
Agreement to Bond	YES	YES	YES	YES
Certificate of Insurance	YES	YES	YES	YES

The lowest tender was submitted by Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd. in the amount of \$45,151,535.00, plus GST. The Engineers Estimate was \$ 51,345,000 and the second tender price from PCL Constructors Westcoast Inc. was \$ 52,631,535.00. The low tender is less than the pre-tender budget value established during the design phase of the project.

Table 3 provides a comparison of the low tender submission to the Engineers Estimate. Generally, there is alignment between the estimate and the low tender price submitted by Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd., with the significant difference being the General Requirements. This is a category where the overhead, profit and site soft costs were included in the estimate. It is assumed that the difference is attributed to a competitive construction market given the current economic challenges.

Table 3 – Comparison of the Engineers Estimate and the Low Tender Submission

Item	Engineers Estimate	Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd.
General Requirements	\$ 7,525,000	\$ 1,732,000
Civil and Site Work	\$ 3,400,000	\$ 4,889,000
Architectural and Structural	\$ 15,790,000	\$ 13,996,000
Process and Building Mechanical	\$ 19,450,000	\$ 19,172,000
Electrical, Instrumentation and Controls	\$ 5,180,000	\$ 5,362,000
Total Tender Price	\$ 51,345,000	\$ 45,151,000

Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd. submitted a compliant tender with all required documentation. The Preliminary Construction Schedule presented complies with the milestone dates set out in the Contract documents. Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd. has a local presence and has completed work on large scale water and wastewater treatment plant projects in the Okanagan and BC in the past. Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd. has listed all approved subcontractors with a local presence and vendors that align with the technical specifications.

AECOM recommends that the City of West Kelowna award the Rose Valley WTP Main Works contract to Maple Reinders Constructors Ltd. in the amount of \$45,151,535.00 plus GST. If the City agrees with our tender evaluation, please proceed with issuing a "Notice of Award" highlighting the additional information required from the tenderer.

Please contact the undersigned if you have any questions.

Sincerely,
AECOM Canada Ltd.



Brett deWynter, P.Eng.
Project Manager
T:250.980.7104
E:brett.dewynter@aecom.com

BD:sk

Encl. Attachment A – Detailed Tender Summary

Cc: Per email distribution list.

Appendix A
City of West Kelowna
Rose Valley WTP Main Works
Detailed Tender Summary

2/24/2021

Title	Estimate	Maple Reinders Construction Ltd.	PCL Constructors Westcoast Inc.	Aecon Water Infrastructure Inc.	Graham Infrastructure LP
Contract Requirements	5,484,650.00	589,000.00	780,000.00	1,259,000.00	
General Requirements	2,040,350.00	1,143,000.00	1,663,162.00	1,939,400.00	
Siteworks	3,400,000.00	4,889,000.00	5,285,000.00	5,856,100.00	
Concrete	12,516,650.00	10,306,000.00	12,685,000.00	14,359,700.00	
Metals	1,436,075.00	1,762,000.00	2,500,000.00	2,125,100.00	
Wood and Plastics	55,000.00	103,000.00	55,000.00	106,100.00	
Thermal and Moisture	144,523.00	775,000.00	850,000.00	848,900.00	
Doors and Windows	803,652.00	501,000.00	600,000.00	959,000.00	
Finishes	669,100.00	517,000.00	550,000.00	693,200.00	
Specialties	165,000.00	32,000.00	250,000.00	65,300.00	
Process	6,825,000.00	4,454,000.00	5,075,000.00	5,510,500.00	
Speciality Equipment	4,030,000.00	3,495,000.00	3,215,000.00	3,858,500.00	
Conveying Systems	400,000.00	275,000.00	420,000.00	336,200.00	
Mechanical	8,195,000.00	10,948,000.00	13,020,000.00	12,158,400.00	
Electrical	3,839,850.00	4,336,000.00	4,573,373.00	4,956,600.00	
Instrumentation	1,340,150.00	1,026,000.00	1,110,000.00	863,300.00	
Tender Price	51,345,000.00	45,151,000.00	52,631,535.00	55,895,300.00	55,633,230.00
GST 5%	2,567,250.00	2,257,550.00	2,631,576.75	2,794,765.00	2,781,661.50
Tender Price plus GST	53,912,250.00	47,408,550.00	55,263,111.75	58,690,065.00	58,414,891.50

NOT PROVIDED

Delta from Low Tender (excl. GST)	-	7,480,535.00	10,744,300.00	10,482,230.00
-----------------------------------	---	--------------	---------------	---------------

Notes

1. Graham Infrastructure LP did not submit a Tender Price Breakdown
2. Aecon Water Infrastructure Tender Price Breakdown stated \$55,837,300.00, difference of \$58,000 from Tender Price in this document

			Estimate		Maple Reinders Construction Ltd.		PCL Constructors Westcoast Inc.		Aecon Water Infrastructure Inc.		Graham Infrastructure LP	
Item #	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Amount	Unit	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
Division 00 - Contract Requirements		Sub-Total Division 00		5,484,650	LS	589,000.00	LS	780,000.00	LS	1,259,000.00		
0.1	Bonding and Insurance	1	LS	5,484,650	LS	589,000.00	LS	780,000.00	LS	1,259,000.00		
Division 01 - General Requirements		Sub-Total Division 01		2,040,350	LS	1,143,000.00	LS	1,663,162.00	LS	1,939,400.00		
0.1	Mobilization and Demobilization (Max 1% of Total Tender Price)	1	LS	513,450	LS	122,000.00	LS	500,000.00	LS	550,000.00		
0.2	Start-up, Commissioning and Training (2% of Total Tender Price)	1	LS	1,026,900	LS	903,000.00	LS	1,054,000.00	LS	1,100,000.00		
0.3	Survey and Record Information	1	LS	250,000	LS	18,000.00	LS	9,162.00	LS	189,400.00		
0.4	O&M Manuals	1	LS	250,000	LS	100,000.00	LS	100,000.00	LS	100,000.00		
Division 02 - Siteworks		Sub-Total Division 31		3,400,000	LS	4,889,000.00	LS	5,285,000.00	LS	5,856,100.00		-
0.1	Excavating, Trenching and Backfilling	1	LS	1,010,000	LS	1,741,000.00	LS	2,000,000.00	LS	2,202,400.00		-
0.2	Yard Piping and Buried Infrastructure	1	LS	1,300,050	LS	2,202,000.00	LS	2,500,000.00	LS	2,594,800.00		-
0.3	Site Grading (including existing roadway gravels)	1	LS	228,300	LS	197,000.00	LS	180,000.00	LS	217,000.00		-
0.4	Asphalt Paving	1	LS	374,400	LS	334,000.00	LS	215,000.00	LS	280,700.00		-
0.5	Fencing and Gates	1	LS	72,250	LS	124,000.00	LS	140,000.00	LS	199,800.00		-
0.6	Landscaping	1	LS	415,000	LS	291,000.00	LS	250,000.00	LS	361,400.00		-
Division 03 - Concrete		Sub-Total Division 03		12,516,650	LS	10,306,000.00	LS	12,685,000.00	LS	14,359,700.00		-
0.1	Treatment Plant Cast-in-Place Concrete	1	LS	4,668,500	LS	3,266,000.00	LS	7,500,000.00	LS	4,665,300.00		-
0.2	Treatment Plant Process Tanks	1	LS	2,635,000	LS	3,249,000.00	LS	1,000,000.00	LS	3,643,400.00		-
0.3	Treatment Plant Pre-Cast Structural Concrete	1	LS	1,529,150	LS	860,000.00	LS	1,000,000.00	LS	996,200.00		-
0.4	Treated Water Reservoir	1	LS	2,634,000	LS	2,682,000.00	LS	2,800,000.00	LS	4,085,200.00		-
0.5	Valve Chamber	1	LS	225,000	LS	90,000.00	LS	300,000.00	LS	830,600.00		
0.6	Miscellaneous Concrete	1	LS	825,000	LS	159,000.00	LS	85,000.00	LS	139,000.00		-
Division 05 - Metals		Sub-Total Division 05		1,436,075	LS	1,762,000.00	LS	2,500,000.00	LS	2,125,100.00		-
Division 06 - Wood and Plastics		Sub-Total Division 06		55,000	LS	103,000.00	LS	55,000.00	LS	106,100.00		
Division 07 - Thermal and Moisture Protection		Sub-Total Division 07		144,523	LS	775,000.00	LS	850,000.00	LS	848,900.00		
Division 08 - Doors and Windows		Sub-Total Division 08		803,652	LS	501,000.00	LS	600,000.00	LS	959,000.00		
Division 09 - Finishes		Sub-Total Division 09		669,100	LS	517,000.00	LS	550,000.00	LS	693,200.00		
Division 10 - Specialties		Sub-Total Division 10		165,000	LS	32,000.00	LS	250,000.00	LS	65,300.00		
Division 11 - Process		Sub-Total Division 11		6,825,000	LS	4,454,000.00	LS	5,075,000.00	LS	5,510,500.00		

NOT PROVIDED

Item #	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Amount	Unit	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
			Estimate		Maple Reinders Construction Ltd.		PCL Constructors Westcoast Inc.		Aecon Water Infrastructure Inc.		Graham Infrastructure LP	
0.1	Inlet Control, flocculation and coagulation	1	LS	485,000.00	LS	384,000.00	LS	1,700,000.00	LS	639,900.00		-
0.2	DAF	1	LS	2,745,000.00	LS	1,491,000.00	LS	1,600,000.00	LS	1,851,500.00		-
0.3	UV Reacor Installation	1	LS	225,000.00	LS	12,000.00	LS	25,000.00	LS	5,900.00		-
0.4	Pumps	1	LS	710,000.00	LS	601,000.00	LS	950,000.00	LS	985,800.00		-
0.5	Filter Backwash Treatment	1	LS	1,145,000.00	LS	296,000.00	LS	50,000.00	LS	1,133,600.00		-
0.6	Sludge Dewatering and Conveyors	1	LS	1,235,000.00	LS	1,542,000.00	LS	600,000.00	LS	700,100.00		-
0.7	Wet Polymer Systems	1	LS	280,000.00	LS	128,000.00	LS	150,000.00	LS	193,700.00		-
Division 13 - Specialty Equipment		Sub-Total Division 13		4,030,000.00	LS	3,495,000.00	LS	3,215,000.00	LS	3,858,500.00		
0.1	Chemical metering pump skids and storage	1	LS	1,010,000.00	LS	1,688,000.00	LS	1,500,000.00	LS	1,456,200.00		
0.2	Filtration equipment and media	1	LS	3,020,000.00	LS	1,747,000.00	LS	1,650,000.00	LS	2,336,200.00		
0.3	Roll-off bins	1	LS		LS	60,000.00	LS	65,000.00	LS	66,100.00		
Division 14 - Conveying Systems		Sub-Total Division 14		400,000	LS	275,000.00	LS	420,000.00	LS	336,200.00		
0.1	Dewatering Conveyors	1	LS	330,000	LS	172,000.00	LS	210,000.00	LS	190,500.00		
0.2	Hoists and Cranes	1	LS	70,000	LS	103,000.00	LS	210,000.00	LS	145,700.00		
Division 15 - Mechanical		Sub-Total Division15		8,195,000	LS	10,948,000.00	LS	13,020,000.00	LS	12,158,400.00		
0.1	Process Piping	1	LS	4,830,000	LS	6,245,000.00	LS	5,600,000.00	LS	4,783,200.00		
0.2	Process Valves	1	LS	975,000	LS	2,560,000.00	LS	4,600,000.00	LS	2,930,700.00		
0.3	HVAC Equipment	1	LS	750,000	LS	643,000.00	LS	800,000.00	LS	1,309,600.00		
0.4	HVAC Ductwork	1	LS	700,000	LS	664,000.00	LS	1,000,000.00	LS	433,100.00		
0.5	Diffusers, Grilles, Filters	1	LS	100,000	LS	64,000.00	LS	55,000.00	LS	74,800.00		
0.6	Plumbing and Fixtures	1	LS	465,000	LS	386,000.00	LS	450,000.00	LS	304,200.00		
0.7	DDC Control System	1	LS	275,000	LS	343,000.00	LS	400,000.00	LS	601,300.00		
0.8	Other Mechanical	1	LS	100,000	LS	43,000.00	LS	115,000.00	LS	1,721,500.00		

NOT PROVIDED

Item #	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Amount	Unit	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
		Estimate			Maple Reinders Construction Ltd.		PCL Constructors Westcoast Inc.		Aecon Water Infrastructure Inc.		Graham Infrastructure LP	
Division 16 - Electrical		Sub-Total Division 16		3,839,850	LS	4,336,000.00	LS	4,573,373.00	LS	4,956,600.00		
0.1	High Voltage and Distribution Equipment/Substation	1	LS	1,000,400	LS	791,000.00	LS	905,000.00	LS	1,016,100.00		
0.2	PDC and MCCs	1	LS	706,400	LS	607,000.00	LS	650,000.00	LS	725,800.00		
0.3	Cables	1	LS	234,550	LS	477,000.00	LS	500,000.00	LS	566,100.00		
0.4	Cable Trays	1	LS	220,000	LS	260,000.00	LS	250,000.00	LS	290,300.00		
0.5	Transformers and Panels	1	LS	75,000	LS	304,000.00	LS	290,000.00	LS	326,600.00		
0.6	Lighting	1	LS	60,000	LS	163,000.00	LS	200,000.00	LS	217,700.00		
0.7	Standby Diesel Generator	1	LS	650,000	LS	434,000.00	LS	450,000.00	LS	508,100.00		
0.8	HVAC Electrical	1	LS	26,000	LS	130,000.00	LS	160,000.00	LS	181,700.00		
0.9	Fire Alarm and PA Systems	1	LS		LS	87,000.00	LS	100,000.00	LS	87,100.00		
0.10	CCTV and Security Systems	1	LS	79,000	LS	173,000.00	LS	170,000.00	LS	188,700.00		
0.11	U/G Conduit and Wiring	1	LS	520,000	LS	650,000.00	LS	628,373.00	LS	798,400.00		
0.12	Other Electrical	1	LS	268,500	LS	260,000.00	LS	270,000.00	LS	50,000.00		
Division 17 - Instrumentation		Sub-Total Division 17		1,340,150	LS	1,026,000.00	LS	1,110,000.00	LS	863,300.00		
0.1	Local Control Panels (SCADA Hardware)	1	LS	422,700	LS	359,000.00	LS	400,000.00	LS	230,000.00		
0.2	Instruments	1	LS	544,350	LS	472,000.00	LS	500,000.00	LS	420,000.00		
0.3	Communication Infrastructure	1	LS	180,000	LS	92,000.00	LS	100,000.00	LS	113,200.00		
0.4	SCADA PLC Programming and Integration	1	LS	143,100	LS	62,000.00	LS	65,000.00	LS	72,600.00		
0.5	Other Instrumentation	1	LS	50,000	LS	41,000.00	LS	45,000.00	LS	27,500.00		

NOT PROVIDED